

HEALTH SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

24 JULY 2019

PRESENT

Councillor Dr. K. Barclay (in the Chair).

Councillors S. Taylor (Vice-Chair), A. Akinola, Mrs. D.L. Haddad, B. Hartley, J. Lloyd, D. Acton (ex-Officio) and D. Western (ex-Officio)

In attendance

Martyn Pritchard	Accountable Officer NHS Trafford and Clinical Commissioning Group (CCG)
Rebecca Demaine	Associate Director of Primary Care, Trafford CCG
Fabiola Fuschi	Democratic and Scrutiny Officer, Trafford Council

Also Present

Councillors Coggins and Welton

Also in attendance

Heather Fairfield Healthwatch Trafford

17. ATTENDANCES

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor Dr. Carr and Councillor Thomas.

18. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Councillors Taylor, Western and Akinola declared a general interest in so far as any matter related to their employment.

Councillor Lloyd declared a general interest in so far as any matter related to her previous position as Executive Member for Health and Wellbeing.

19. URGENT BUSINESS (IF ANY)

There were no items of urgent business received.

20. QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC

The following public question was submitted via email:

“I have a question for the Scrutiny Committee

I have seen this Committee in action under three Chair leaders over time. I am regularly present at all CCG Board meetings over a long time with questions and some success in pressing for change/ improvements. I have wider involvement

Health Scrutiny Committee
24 July 2019

and interests in Health and Social Care, in what is currently a very confusing plethora of activity out there whichever way you look.

On Scrutiny and the reasons why this Committee exists, it does not get to "good or outstanding" in my considered view and from a lot of experience of the "critical friend" role in action on issues. With the subject tonight, it seems to be in the catch up zone, discussing a major problem in which it has no real authority to decide and pronounce. I am well familiar with the background. Do you agree that under the new "annual scrutiny leadership cycle", it has to sharpen its teeth and forget the "friend" in the critical phrase, with this agenda problem?"

The Chairman acknowledged the question and explained that a detailed response would be sent to the questioner in due course.

The Chairman added that the Health Scrutiny Committee derived its powers from The Health and Social Care Act 2001 and the National Health Service Act 2006 and its main functions were to hold to account the decision makers in relation to health and well-being issues in Trafford and to strengthen the voice of local people, ensuring that their needs and experiences were considered as an integral part of the commissioning and delivery of health services and that those services were effective and safe.

A Health Scrutiny protocol was in place to outline working arrangements between the Health Scrutiny Committee, key NHS partners, HealthWatch Trafford and the Older Person's Champion on how best deliver the duties placed on them by legislation. However, the Committee was constrained in its actions by the legislation.

The Chairman informed the Committee that Mrs. Judie Collins, Chair of the Altrincham and Bowdon Civic Society wished to make a statement concerning this evening's agenda item. Three minutes were allocated to Mrs. Collins to present her information.

Mrs. Collins addressed the Committee and explained that, at the beginning of the process concerning the development of the Altrincham Hub, there had been no adequate public consultation over the hospital's future. This had been confirmed by a decision of the High Court, following judicial review. Subsequently, the developers had started engaging with residents and the Altrincham and Bowdon Civic Society had been able to express its concern with regard to maintaining the heritage of the building. Currently, regular meetings with CCG's project managers were taking place. Mrs. Collins added that the Altrincham and Bowdon Civic Society would like to see the NHS Property Services taking part with the CCG in the lesson learned exercise regarding this matter.

The Committee sought and received clarification from Mrs. Collins with regard to the involvement of the Altrincham and Bowdon Civic Society with the shortlisting of developers, the impact on the community of the building not being fully utilised and the feedback from patients' groups on its destination to library services and GP Practices.

The Chairman thanked Mrs. Collins for her contribution to the meeting of the Committee.

21. THE ALTRINCHAM HUB DEVELOPMENT

The Committee gave consideration to a report of the Accountable Officer for NHS Trafford and Clinical Commissioning Group (CCG) which informed of the the background of the Altrincham Hub development and the CCG's response to the outcome of the independent review of the Hub, commissioned by the Greater Manchester Health and Social Care Partnership.

The author of the report, accompanied by the Associate Director of Primary Care Trafford CCG, attended the meeting to present the information and to address the enquiries of the Committee.

In May 2015, a full business case had been approved by the CCG Governing Body to locate a health care hub on the site of the former Altrincham Hospital which was owned by a local developer. However, due to historic governance processes and lack of appropriate challenge of the business case, the project led to expending of funds and resources that could have been saved.

The Accountable Officer explained that the independent report commissioned by the Greater Manchester Health and Social Care Partnership on the Hub had been published on 6th March 2019. The CCG had accepted the nine recommendations listed in the report which urged the organisation to put in place measures to ensure the efficient accomplishment of future projects of similar size and strategic importance.

The Accountable Officer went on to explain that, in addition to addressing those nine recommendations, the CCG also wanted to focus on the wider issues in the review, such as ensuring that appropriate governance arrangements were in place during the key decision making process, building a high performing Governing Body able to appropriately challenge future schemes and identify risks and the ability of management to deliver agreed actions. As a result, the responses to the recommendations and the plans and processes put in place to address the wider organisational issues were reviewed, internally, by the CCG's Governing Body and the Audit Committee and, subsequently, approved by the Greater Manchester Health and Social Care Partnership.

The Accountable Officer also informed the Committee of the future use of the Altrincham Hub and confirmed that the CCG had entered a legal agreement with two GP Practices which would move in the near future from their existing buildings into the hub, providing primary care services for over 24,000 residents. This would be pivotal in securing the opening of a community pharmacy in the building. The Accountable Officer also reported that conversations with the Council were ongoing about the possibility of an integrated health and social care team located in the Hub. The NHS Property Services was in conversation with commercial organisations about the use of the third floor.

Health Scrutiny Committee 24 July 2019

The Committee sought reassurance from the CCG's representatives that the lesson learnt from these circumstances would lead to a more robust procurement process and a clear audit trail of decision making within the organisation. Members were informed that, as a consequence of the independent review and the acceptance of its findings, the CCG had developed a three phase response which had consisted in the review of CCG's Governing Body's constitution signed off by NHS England, the assurance of effective scrutiny of decision making through the revised Terms of Reference of committees and sub-committee within the organisation and the review of all policies and procedures. The outcome of the internal review also ensured that effective record keeping of decision making was in place to comply with good governance standards as well as with openness and transparency through publication of records.

Ward Members, who attended this evening's meeting, highlighted the frustration of residents about this matter, considering the current national and local context, characterised by financial constraints and reduction in public spend. Ward Members queried the function of the Council's Health Scrutiny Committee with regard to this issue and whether there was a lesson to be learnt by NHS England on this matter. It was explained that the amount of information available to the Health Scrutiny Committee had been limited. However, CCG's processes had changed and Members of the Council's Executive were being invited to attend CCG's meetings where discussions took place on the quality of services, their performance and finance.

The Committee also queried the CCG agreement with NHS Property Services to retain the financial risk of void space through an indemnity deed and the role of NHS Property Services in this decision. It was explained that, currently, the yearly cost to the CCG of not having tenants in the building was over £2 M. However, the CCG was determined to work with partners to make the best of the building.

With regard to the future use of the building, Members asked what would be the cost of converting the third floor into a commercial space. It was explained that the third floor was already organised as an office space. However, the conversion cost would be around £1.3M, should a different destination be decided.

The Committee raised questions regarding the lack of competitive procurement for selecting a developer for the hub. It was explained that the CCG had now secured the expertise of STAR Procurement; the management of large scale projects in future would follow national standards of procurement.

Members requested to clarify the relationship between CCG and NHS England. It was explained that, within the Devolution Agreement, Greater Manchester Health and Social Care Partnership had to report to NHS England. CCG had quarterly meeting with the Greater Manchester Health and Social Care Partnership regarding the lesson learnt on the Hub development.

Members requested an update on progress against the CCG's action plan at the meeting of the Committee in November 2019. Members also asked to visit the site with a member of the CCG to fully understand the potential use of spaces.

Health Scrutiny Committee
24 July 2019

In addition, Members requested to have access to agendas and minutes of the CCG Governing Body's meetings. It was explained that these were available on line, on the Trafford CCG's web-site.

RESOLVED:

1. That an update on the CCG Action Plan on the Altrincham Hub be presented at the meeting of the Health Scrutiny Committee on 8th November 2019;
2. That members visit the Altrincham Hub building with a representative of the CCG to fully understand the potential use of spaces;
3. That further information be provided by the CCG to the Committee with regard to NHS England and NHS Property Services and their role in the lesson learnt process and risk management.

The meeting commenced at 6.30 pm and finished at 7.30 pm